

AGENCY FOR INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT UNITED STATES OF AMERICA A. I. D. MISSION TO EL SALVADOR C/O AMERICAN EMBASSY. SAN SALVADOR, EL SALVADOR, C. A.

923

ACTION MEMORANDUM FOR THE MISSION DIRECTOR

FROM:

Gordon Strauß

PRO)

SUBJECT:

Closeout of the I.E.S.C Technical Assistance to

Business Project No. 519-0395

In accordance with Handbook 3, Chapter 14, and USAID/San Salvador policy, attached is the Project Assistance Completion Report (PACR) for the I.E.S.C. Technical Assistance to Business. The purpose of this project was to assist Salvadoran private sector companies to become more productive, quality conscious, and cost efficient in order to help in the economic reactivation of El Salvador.

The PACR summarizes the accomplishments of the project, and provides highlights of the financial performance.

Recommendation: That you approve the attached Project Assistance Completion Report.

Approved:

Disapproved:

Date:

1/16/96

Drafted by:LLuna, PRO
Clearance: RBlanco, PRO
DGardella, PRO
CAdams, CONT
LPizarro,OCG

N PKranstover, SDO KEllis, DDir date 12/14/95

date 12-14-95 date 12-14-95

date 1/12/96 date 1/5/96

date 1/5/96 date 5/1/6/10

Office of the Controller

REVIEWED

مال مال

PROJECT ASSISTANCE COMPLETION REPORTS

I. SUMMARY OF THE PROJECT

A. Goal and Purpose of the Project

The goal of the Project was to increase equitable economic growth.

The purpose was to assist Salvadoran private sector companies to become more productive, quality conscious, and cost efficient. IESC provided technical assistance to companies in order to achieve the following:

- Productive employment;
- Expansion of business;
- Increase in productivity and sales;
- Improved competitiveness;
- Technology transfer, and
- Avoidance of business closures.

B. Project components

- 1. Provides technical assistance to 30 companies identified by IESC and Salvadoran Industrial Association (ASI) under its Industrial Reconversion Program.
- Provides technical assistance to 10 companies identified by IESC under the industrial sectors define by ASI but not necessarily participants in the ASI Reconversion Program.

An amendment to the Cooperative Agreement was approved on June 1993, to free IESC from exclusive commitment to the Industrial Reconversion Program carried by ASI, and permit IESC to proceeded with contracting other clients involved in the industrial sector.

C. Present Status of the Project.

The IESC Project was authorized on July 7, 1992. The original PACD was June 30, 1994, and it was extended without cost to June 30, 1995, to allow IESC to complete the Project's objectives, because by then IESC had only achieved 43% of the target. The Project was closed-out early (on March 31, 1995) because IESC was able to assist only 22 companies, of the 40 planned by the end of the Project.

2

II. FINANCIAL STATUS (as of November 06/95, see Annex 1)

A. Obligations versus Expenditures by line Item

Element No.	Element description	Obligation	Commitment	Expenditure	Pipeline
01	Administra.	\$260,000	\$260,000	\$260,000	0
02	Technical assistance cost	\$99,866	\$99,866	\$85,553	\$14,313
	TOTAL	\$359,866	\$359,866	\$345,553	\$14,313

NOTE: The original obligation of funds was \$500,000 (\$260,000 for administrative cost and \$240,000 for technical assistance). Due to the early close-out of the project, on August 21, 1995 funds in the amount of \$140,134.02 were deobligated.

B. Summary of Counterpart Contributions made by the B/G, donors and participants. Planned versus actual inputs, IESC quarterly report on counterpart contribution (as of 03/31/95).

Description	Planned	Cumulative to date
Cash Client Contribution	\$374,000	\$104,967.66
In-Kind IESC VE Project days IESC recruiting	\$188,000	\$281,028.68 \$57,669.10
TOTAL	\$562,800	\$443,665.44

III. PROJECT ACCOMPLISHMENTS

A. <u>Planned EOPS</u>

- Productive employment
- Business expansion
- Increase productivity and sales
- Technology transfer
- Avoidance of business closures

Progress to Date

- 233 new jobs
- In twelve companies
- From 10% 20% increase in
- productivity in 13 companies
- Partially achieved in 22 companies
- None

В.	Major Outputs	LOP	CUM	%of LOP
part	ry out sub-projects cially financed by Grant	40	22	55%

During the life of the Project IESC provided technical assistance to a total of 22 companies. These companies received assistance in the areas of production, information systems, and administrative/financial controls, to allow them to increase productivity, to reduce costs, to improve product quality, to increase competitiveness and to diversify production. A no-cost extension was authorized beyond the original PACD of June 30 1994, in order to complete the targets. However, by March 1995, IESC had only achieved 55% of the Project objectives, but had expended approximately 85% of LOP funding.

One of the causes of the Project's poor performance was that IESC and ASI were unable to work together. ASI took too long to carry out companies' diagnoses, which were supposed to be followed by IESC' technical assistance. During the first year of IESC Project implementation, ASI did not request assistance from them. In many cases in which the client firm needed to restructure or resolve problems related to its administrative and accounting systems, ASI provided the technical assistance itself without any involvement from IESC

The inability of IESC and ASI to work together was compounded by the high cost of IESC's services. IESC's cost structure was not competitive with similar, but lower-cost, services being provided by other international organizations and was higher than what many companies were willing to pay. Many ASI clients requested technical assistance to solve only their major problems and did not carry out a complete reconversion program (including improvements in production, marketing, administration, and quality control) because they

were unable or unwilling to pay the high cost of IESC's services. Some ASI clients contracted other international organizations at a lower cost, never requesting IESC's assistance. Even when freed from the commitment to work exclusively with ASI clients, IESC was unable to assist as many companies as planned due to its uncompetitive cost structure.

Based on this situation, the PRO Office recommended an early close-out of the Project, the deobligation of unexpended funds, and reobligation of those funds to a Mission activity that better contributed to the Broad-based Economic Growth Strategic Objective (SO2).

IV. EVALUATIONS AND AUDITS

A. Evaluations

A project evaluation was deemed not necessary during a review of the project's performance held in January 1995. The project had expended approximately 85% of the LOP funding, but only achieved 55% of its objectives.

The reasons for this poor performance were well understood, and there were no plans for a follow-on project. Therefore, the review committee decided that an evaluation would have little utility to the Mission.

B. Audits.

Based on information provided by the Controllers Office, audits are conducted at the IESC main offices in Connecticut. The last Core Grant audit covered CY'92 only, and A-133 audit for CY'93 is on-going.

V. SUMMARY OF LESSONS LEARNED

- The design of the Project did not consider competition from other international organizations providing the same services as IESC, but at lower cost. The design also did not take into account the client companies' ability and willingness to pay for such services. These oversights in the design became constraints during the implementation of the project.
- Project accomplishment showed that given the type and cost of technical assistance, the Project suited more medium and large firms. 65% of the 22 enterprises that received assistance, were large firms. Additionally, the impact on productive employment generation was low.
- The lack of a promotional program was reflected in the low accomplishment of the Project. In spite of an amendment to the Project to free IESC from the restriction of carrying

out 30 projects with ASI only, the communication with other local industries organizations to promote the technical assistance was insufficient.

VI. RECOMMENDATIONS

- Before designing a similar Project, a diagnosis of the needs of the beneficiaries, and the availability of technical assistance services from local and other international organizations should be conducted.
- Greater attention must be given to ensuring projects are cost-effective.

						ا و المحدود و المراجع المحدود و الم	A STATE OF THE STA	NA.
eri Amerikan			Iname of the same			The state of the same of the state of the same of the	PEPROT PAGE N	AN AND
REPORT ID: MXRMP19		PROJE	LESALVADUR	STATUSER	EPORT.	The state of the s	MISSION PAGE	NO
REPORT DATE: 11/06/95		A Comment of the Comm	AS OF IC	2/31/95	And The Control of the Control			and the same of
CURR, CODE : 001	CURRENCY NAM	ELLU.S. DOLLAF	S. T. T.	WWW.	ALC: NO.	ATT TO BOYAN	PPA PEN	17
PROJECT_NO. 11 5190395.	HENT NO.: 1 ADMINISTRATUS COSTS 260.000 (0), 260.000 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0							
PROJECT ELEMENT NO.	PROJECT ELEMENT DE	SCRIETION	DBLIGATION RES	JN(D)	مسوسو مع الموادية المساسوس	A STATE OF THE STA	The state of the s	-
EARMARK DOCUMENT NO.	EARMARK DESCRIPTIO		EARMARK	E E	~ = ~ · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	- AAANIA B	PIPELINE /	ADI
COMMIT. DOCUMENT NO.	COMMIT DESCRIPTION ACFORD		COMMITMENT COM RES	(CR)	1SBURSEMENTS	ACCRUALS	UNLIQUIDATED	AUV
A STATE OF THE PARTY OF THE PAR							0 14.313 0 14.313	
ELEMENT NO 1 1	ADMINISTRATIVE COS	TS.	560.00	07 (0)	560,000	O 2	0	4475
CRANT			1	and the same	Samuella Sa Samuella Samuella Sa	e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e	The state of the s	T-Migs
GIVEN 1		A STATE OF THE STA	E CONTRACTOR OF THE PARTY OF TH		710.000	المستخفية والتقادة المستديد	The second secon	-
LIQUIDATED EARMARKS		A TOTAL TOTAL	260.00	E T	260,000	distribution of the state of th	ا المراجع المحافظة المستخدم المنظمة ا	ر در دو
ELEMENT TOTAL GRA	NE TOTAL		260.00	107	260.000		0.00	et Janes
e de la companya de La companya de la co						The same was a second of the s	en e	
ELEMENT NO . 2	TECHNICAL ASSISTANT	CE COSTS	99.86	TO:	85.553	عقوبها المناه المناه والمناه المناه	14,313,000 cm	# = 1
GRANTE		TOP COSTS 260.000 (D) 260.000 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0						
CA-5190395A00208000(TECHNICAL ABST COS	C SERV CORP (1ESC) 29,864 (0)						
CA-5190395A00208000	TECHNICAL ASSISCO	STS	79.86	§₹(C)	85,553		14,313	*
	GRANT TOTALS LOAN							
ELEMENT (DIVER	NT	Andrews and the same and the sa	77,000	E. COL	್ಲಿ್, 8ರೀಚಿರಿತ್ನು‱	managa ay amin'ny ara-daharaha ara-daharaha a Managamba a	- Adding a second of the secon	And Milder
PPD ICAT TOTAL C:	A STATE OF THE STA		V		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		in the control of the second s	المهاسط الطالق
PROJECT TOTALS.		A CONTRACTOR OF THE CONTRACTOR	7					
GRANT TOTALS	The state of the s	## 學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學學						
PROJECT TOTAL	The second of th	A STATE OF THE STA	359.86	<u>6</u> (0)	345,553	or	14,313	A ##1 -
•	ا الله الله الله الله الله الله الله ال	and the second of the second o	,					
	के विशेष के जिल्ला है जिल्ला है के स्वर्ध के किया है जिल्ला है कि किया है कि किया है कि किया है कि किया है कि	TARCE, COSTS 99.86 (D) - 85.553 0, 14.313 2.0 COSTS 99.86 (C) 85.553 0 14.313 0 CORP (IESC) 99.86 (D) 85.553 0 14.313 0 359.86 (D) 345.553 0 14.313 0 359.86 (D) 345.553 0 14.313 0 359.88 (D) 345.553 0 14.313 0 359.88 (D) 345.553 0 14.313 0						
4 45-44	44.0	A finish to the second of the		Á		in a second control of the second		elekt cam
•	with the second	And the state of t	·····················///////////////	A		and the second second	ing.	erren anga
				Prop.	•	A et a	S. V.	13 25 2 1
The second of th		The state of the s	at mining	A	in in the second of the second	and a second	الله المستقدم المعالم المعالم المستقدم المستقدم المستقدم المستقدم المستقدم المستقدم المستقدم المستقدم المستقدم المستقدم المستقدم الم المستقدم المستقدم ا	در میداند. در
الله الله الله الله الله الله الله الله	ADMINISTRATIVE COSTS 260.000 (D) 260.000 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0							
in the second of		Control of the Contro	a se partie a mini .		Same in Section 1995.	and the same of th	Parana ayan da wasan arang ayan ayan ayan ayan ayan ayan ayan a	-
			AND THE P			CONTRACTOR OF STREET	A CONTRACTOR OF THE PARTY OF TH	A.
and a summary place of the control o			10 120 图 图 图	The state of the s	्रे विश्वविद्याल <mark>ी सम्बद्धाः स्</mark> वर्ते	And the second s	The state of the s	
and any in the same of the sam			The state of			designation of the later state		ATT PAR